Principles of Writing

Rhetoric 102

Holguin

Spring 2018

**Peer Review Instructions: Formal Essay One**

The first formal essay requires you to act as a critic to your fellow students’ papers and spend time reviewing and analyzing their arguments, use of the primary and secondary sources, and general problems that might arise from word choices, syntax, and structure. You need to finish all your critiques by next week to return to your fellow students before you turn in your final drafts to me. Use your time in and out of the class wisely.

You are asked to use the electronic versions of these peer reviews. You can then choose to either email the documents to your group OR provide them with hard-copies. You must send me electronic copies of all peer reviews to Blackboard before the final draft is due. This peer review process goes into your first draft grade.

**Editor’s Name: Horris Feng**

**Student’s Name: Teague Tong**

1. What is the student’s thesis? Highlight it in his or her paper. What fairy tale is used in this argument? Is anything missing from the introduction in terms of context or background? Fix any errors you find in the paper and highlight those issues for the student.

Teague’s thesis is “Disney made some tiny changes in fairy tales, but did not change the main ideas, and it remains the concept of class differentiation in Cinderella as well”, which does not seem obvious in his introductory paragraphs. I find it in the last paragraphs.

Teague uses Brothers Grimm’s version of Cinderella.

Teague misses the summary of Zipes’ thesis, his own main argument, and the “so-what?” factor in the introduction.

1. How does the student’s close-reading of the film and fairy tale versions of *Cinderella* further support or naysay Zipes’ reading of ideological issues with Disney? Does the student effectively close-read the film and the fairy tale or does they need further analysis and/or support? What would you suggest adding? Show the students places in the paper that he or she needs more evidence from the film or text in the paper itself.

Teague’s close-reading is good, but he could close-read the film and the fairy tale more creatively, for example, he could consider making use of the dialogue or concrete details in his primary sources.

I think Teague can either enrich his close-reading or add new evidence to support his argument.

1. How does the student summarize Zipes’ argument? Is this an accurate summary of the article? Does a brief summary occur in the introductory paragraphs? If not, this is a structural issue you should point out. Does the student connect the new example of *Cinderella* to the Zipes’ use of *Snow White*? Does that connection work for the coherence of the argument as a whole?

It seems that Teague doesn’t summarize Zipes’ thesis or his summary is so simple that I don’t think it is an accurate summary of Zipes’ article. Thus, he needs to add this part in his introduction.

No, Teague doesn’t connect his new example of Cinderella to Zipes’ use of Snow White, which seems to be a common problem for many students.

1. Does the paper consistently signpost its thesis and transition from one point to the next with helpful cues? Highlight any clunky moments where you think the paper lacks a cohesive thread and indicate paragraphs and page numbers here. For example, if the student only uses “first”/ “second”/ “in conclusion” to show changes from one paragraph to the next, you should explain ideas for smoother transitions. Keep in mind, Zipes could act as a helpful transitional thread.

The paper signposts its thesis and transition from one point to the next with cues, but not consistently.

The beginning of paragraph #4, page 3 (Add “besides, ~” or “what’s more, ~”)

The beginning of paragraph #6, page 5 (Use “all in all, ~” or something else to replace “as conclusion, ~”)

1. Pick two sentences that seem awkward or just don’t make sense to you the way they are currently written. Rewrite them without the problems you see persisting.
2. Sentence One

Cinderella’s step-mother and two step sisters treated her very badly and attempted to prevent her married with the prince; ~

* + Revised Sentence

Cinderella’s step-mother and two step sisters treated her very badly and attempted to prevent her from marrying the prince; ~

1. Sentence One

A bird helped her go into the ball.

* + Revised Sentence

A bird helped her attend the ball.

1. Does the paper fulfill all of the requirements for the final draft? What still needs to be added? Make a checklist for the student of things he or she still needs to write.

Use 3-step approach to quote and paraphrase Zipes’ article

Add transition between paragraphs

Create works cited page and intext citation

Extend his essay to at least 6 full pages

Close-read his primary sources more creatively

Try to quote or paraphrase Zipes’ arguments at the end of his paragraphs

Work out an explicit thesis responding to Zipes’ article

Make ideologies explicit or at least point them out\*

(\* means really important)

1. What are the key moments/scenes from *Cinderella* that were used as visual support? What are the key textual support moments from the fairy tale? How does this paper’s interpretation of Disney’s ideologies differ from Zipes’?

Disney’s version: stepsisters’ ugly appearance, Cinderella obeyed her stepmother and stepsisters’ order, the finery in which Cinderella went to the ball, and a song sung by Cinderella

Brothers Grimm’ version: the wealthy family which Cinderella belonged to, the finery Cinderella dressed in the ball, and the song sung by birds

This paper’s interpretation of Disney’s ideologies seems to be similar to Zipes’.

1. Check for any MLA format errors or missing information. Highlight these issues on the student’s paper.

Works cited page and intext citation

1. What is the paper’s “so what?” factor? Does the conclusion include this larger issue? What does the conclusion need?

No, the conclusion doesn’t include this larger issue.

The conclusion needs interaction with Zipes’ article and a “so-what?” factor.

1. What grade does this essay deserve if this was a final draft? What was your favorite part?

B/B-

My favorite part is Teague’s analysis about the class differentiation that appears in both versions of Cinderella, which is in paragraph #3, page 2.